

4000 DEFENSE PENTAGON WASHINGTON, D.C. 20301-4000

NOV - 2 2022

The Honorable Martin Heinrich Chairman Subcommittee on Military Construction, Veterans Affairs, and Related Agencies Committee on Appropriations United States Senate Washington, DC 20510

Dear Mr. Chairman:

The Department's response to House Report 117–81, page 16, accompanying H.R. 4355, Military Construction, Veterans Affairs, and Related Agencies Appropriations Bill, 2022, which requests that the Department provide a report detailing: (1) the current parking situation and requirements of Tripler Army Medical Center (TAMC) facility over the next 4 years; (2) the estimated cost of constructing a parking facility separately from the recapitalization efforts of the primary TAMC facility, to include likely cost items and possible category codes; and (3) the estimated timeline for designing and constructing a typical parking structure in Hawaii.

Hawaii has long been the medical nexus for Indo-Pacific Command. The community's concerns for parking have been acknowledged and are being addressed. The final report includes detailed information for ongoing and future projects, operational collaborations, as well as recommendations for further remediation of the parking shortfall that has evolved with the growth of TAMC's footprint.

Thank you for your continued strong support for the health and well-being of our Service members, veterans, and their families. I am sending similar letters to the other congressional defense committees.

Sincerely,

Gilbert R. Cisneros, Jr.

Enclosure:

As stated

cc:

The Honorable John Boozman Ranking Member



4000 DEFENSE PENTAGON WASHINGTON, D.C. 20301-4000

NOV - 2 2022

The Honorable Jack Reed Chairman Committee on Armed Services United States Senate Washington, DC 20510

Dear Mr. Chairman:

The Department's response to House Report 117–81, page 16, accompanying H.R. 4355, Military Construction, Veterans Affairs, and Related Agencies Appropriations Bill, 2022, which requests that the Department provide a report detailing: (1) the current parking situation and requirements of Tripler Army Medical Center (TAMC) facility over the next 4 years; (2) the estimated cost of constructing a parking facility separately from the recapitalization efforts of the primary TAMC facility, to include likely cost items and possible category codes; and (3) the estimated timeline for designing and constructing a typical parking structure in Hawaii.

Hawaii has long been the medical nexus for Indo-Pacific Command. The community's concerns for parking have been acknowledged and are being addressed. The final report includes detailed information for ongoing and future projects, operational collaborations, as well as recommendations for further remediation of the parking shortfall that has evolved with the growth of TAMC's footprint.

Thank you for your continued strong support for the health and well-being of our Service members, veterans, and their families. I am sending similar letters to the other congressional defense committees.

Sincerely,

Gilbert R. Cisneros, Jr.

Enclosure:

As stated

cc:

The Honorable James M. Inhofe Ranking Member



4000 DEFENSE PENTAGON WASHINGTON, D.C. 20301-4000

NOV - 2 2022

The Honorable Adam Smith Chairman Committee on Armed Services U.S. House of Representatives Washington, DC 20515

Dear Mr. Chairman:

The Department's response to House Report 117–81, page 16, accompanying H.R. 4355, Military Construction, Veterans Affairs, and Related Agencies Appropriations Bill, 2022, which requests that the Department provide a report detailing: (1) the current parking situation and requirements of Tripler Army Medical Center (TAMC) facility over the next 4 years; (2) the estimated cost of constructing a parking facility separately from the recapitalization efforts of the primary TAMC facility, to include likely cost items and possible category codes; and (3) the estimated timeline for designing and constructing a typical parking structure in Hawaii.

Hawaii has long been the medical nexus for Indo-Pacific Command. The community's concerns for parking have been acknowledged and are being addressed. The final report includes detailed information for ongoing and future projects, operational collaborations, as well as recommendations for further remediation of the parking shortfall that has evolved with the growth of TAMC's footprint.

Thank you for your continued strong support for the health and well-being of our Service members, veterans, and their families. I am sending similar letters to the other congressional defense committees.

Sincerely,

Gilbert R. Cisneros, Jr.

Enclosure: As stated

cc:

The Honorable Mike D. Rogers Ranking Member



4000 DEFENSE PENTAGON WASHINGTON, D.C. 20301-4000

NOV - 2 2022

The Honorable Debbie Wasserman Schultz Chairwoman Subcommittee on Military Construction, Veterans Affairs, and Related Agencies Committee on Appropriations U.S. House of Representatives Washington, DC 20515

Dear Madam Chairwoman:

The Department's response to House Report 117–81, page 16, accompanying H.R. 4355, Military Construction, Veterans Affairs, and Related Agencies Appropriations Bill, 2022, which requests that the Department provide a report detailing: (1) the current parking situation and requirements of Tripler Army Medical Center (TAMC) facility over the next 4 years; (2) the estimated cost of constructing a parking facility separately from the recapitalization efforts of the primary TAMC facility, to include likely cost items and possible category codes; and (3) the estimated timeline for designing and constructing a typical parking structure in Hawaii.

Hawaii has long been the medical nexus for Indo-Pacific Command. The community's concerns for parking have been acknowledged and are being addressed. The final report includes detailed information for ongoing and future projects, operational collaborations, as well as recommendations for further remediation of the parking shortfall that has evolved with the growth of TAMC's footprint.

Thank you for your continued strong support for the health and well-being of our Service members, veterans, and their families. I am sending similar letters to the other congressional defense committees.

Sincerely,

Gilbert R. Cisneros, Jr.

Enclosure: As stated

cc:

The Honorable John Carter Ranking Member

REPORT TO THE CONGRESSIONAL DEFENSE COMMITTEES



Tripler Army Medical Center Parking Assessment

In Response To: House Report 117–81, page 15, accompanying H.R. 4355, Military Construction, Veterans Affairs, and Related Agencies Appropriations Act, 2022

The estimated cost of this report or study for the Department of Defense (DoD) is approximately \$18,100 in Fiscal Years 2020 - 2022. This includes \$10,000 in expenses and \$8,100 in DoD labor.

Generated on 2022Jan07 RefID: 3-0DC6BBE

Executive Summary

This report is in response to House Report 117–81, page 16, accompanying H.R. 4355, Military Construction, Veterans Affairs, and Related Agencies Appropriations Bill, 2022, which requests a report on the parking deficit at Tripler Army Medical Center (TAMC). Specifically, the Director, Defense Health Agency (DHA), is responding to requests for information on the current parking shortfall, and estimated timeline and cost to construct new TAMC parking structure(s), which have been developed in coordination between U.S. Army Health Facilities Planning Agency (HFPA) and DHA Facilities Division in consultation with Department of Veterans Affairs (VA) through the DoD/VA Program Office.

Background

DHA is responsible for the facility life-cycle management of military medical treatment facilities worldwide, as well as providing ready and resilient facilities that sustain military medicine's mission assurance of world-class health care for America's warfighters and their families. These facilities include almost every medical center, hospital, ambulatory care center, satellite center, medical training facility, veterinary treatment facility, and many of the medical research facilities in the Military Health System (MHS).

TAMC and the Spark M. Matsunaga VA Medical Center are adjacent, shared facilities on the island of Oahu in Hawaii. The combined facilities form the largest military and veterans' medical platform in the Pacific Basin, with responsibility for nearly 450,000 eligible beneficiaries. According to a 2018 assessment, using formulas in the Department of Defense (DoD) Unified Facilities Criteria (UFC) 4–510–01, *Design: Military Medical Facilities*, the medical platform should have 5,915 parking stalls to accommodate the TAMC/VA workforce and patients. Currently, TAMC has 3,713 parking stalls, 2,202 stalls less than the HFPA estimate. This HFPA parking estimate may be overstated, because not all functions on the TAMC/VA campus are directly related to patient care. UFC 4-510-01 parking formulas support patient care activities and may inflate non-patient care requirements. Although the exact parking stall deficit is difficult to pinpoint, we believe the range of the shortfall is between 1,500 – 2,202 stalls.

The TAMC and Matsunaga facilities are co-located on a hill with scattered surface parking that is congested during peak hours. Constrained geography limits site access to a single control point which can cause severe traffic congestion during peak hours. This congestion causes some patients to arrive extra early for appointments and park longer than average, further accentuating the parking shortfall. For these reasons, veterans, Service members, and Service member families have difficulty gaining access and finding parking at TAMC. This is particularly true for the elderly, injured, and those who have difficulty walking unassisted.

Discussion

Per UFC 2-100-01, *Installation Master Planning*, "Master planning is a continuous analytical process that involves evaluation of factors affecting the present and future physical development and operation of an installation. This evaluation forms the basis for determination of

development objectives and planning proposals to solve current problems and meet future needs. For military installations, planning is accomplished primarily at the installation level through a comprehensive and collaborative planning process that results in a Master Plan." TAMC is part of United States Army Garrison Hawaii (USAGH), which is responsible for preparing all installation real property master plans (RPMPs). United States Army Installation Management Command is responsible for approving all Army RPMPs.

In Fiscal Year (FY) 2016 ground was broken on the \$122M Military Construction (MILCON) Medical/Dental Clinic Replacement at Marine Corps Base (MCB) Kaneohe Bay, Oahu. The clinic was completed and placed in service in August 2020. In addition, construction was awarded in 2016 for the \$123.8M MILCON Behavioral Health/Dental Clinic Addition at Schofield Barracks. This 76,577 square foot facility was placed in service in February 2021 and included a parking garage, behavioral health, dental clinic, and physical therapy. These two new facilities (especially the Schofield Barracks addition) shifted some primary care workload away from TAMC and helped to reduce TAMC parking demand.

Section 703 of the National Defense Authorization Act (NDAA) for FY 2017 required the Secretary of Defense to report on restructuring or realigning military medical treatment facilities. Section 703 stated, "Tripler will be considered for recapitalization of the aging platform with the final location and capability dependent on further analysis of Hawaii market capabilities and military demand." In FY 2021, DHA began a Market Facilities Master Plan Study for Hawaii which will consider the section 703 recommendation, the recent MILCON investments at MCB Kaneohe Bay and Schofield Barracks, and ongoing planning for future projects at Joint Base Pearl Harbor Hickam (JBPHH).

In addition, the FY 2021 Hawaii Market Facilities Master Plan Study is expected to evaluate options to recapitalize TAMC such as rebuilding in-place or building new on an undeveloped site. This study will consider prior planning efforts. If rebuilding on-site is the preferred solution, this then presents an opportunity to include a parking structure as part of a medical MILCON expansion project. A standalone parking structure project generally would not rank high enough in the DHA's Capital Investment Decision Model to supersede medical treatment facilities advocated for funding.

Continued partnership between the VA and DoD on the TAMC campus may produce additional solutions, as was hoped when they co-located in 2005. The DoD and VA continue to study potential opportunities to reduce parking demand by leveraging off-campus clinic leases for medical care.

The "VA Maintaining Internal Systems and Strengthening Integrated Outside Networks (MISSION) Act of 2018" established an Asset and Infrastructure Review Commission to examine the VA's assets and to make recommendations for modernizing and realigning medical facilities. The VA's Hawaii Market Assessment was launched in January 2020, and the study has just begun the bulk of its data collection on the main TAMC campus after completing work at ancillary locations.

The VA operates a multilevel parking structure on the TAMC campus. This 5-story structure houses approximately 125 parking stalls per floor. Repeated efforts to expand this structure using VA unspecified minor construction authorities have failed. This is primarily due to the extraordinary costs of construction on the Hawaiian Islands. All bids received for the proposed addition exceeded the VA's \$10M unspecified minor construction authority. A recent study conducted by PBR Hawaii & Associates, Inc. for the Ulupono Initiative states the construction price of a single stall (or space) in a commercial parking structure on the island of Oahu ranges from \$42K for podium parking to \$57K for parking garages (\$127-\$163/ft²). See Figure 1.

In 2020 1Q dollars On-grade parking: residential ther Maui On-grade parking: commercial rking: commercial Maui Garage pa Urban Location Island Kaua'i Island O'ahu Island Cost per stall: \$42,000 \$59,000 \$3,100 \$3,600 \$3,800 \$3,40 \$5,400 \$6,200 \$6,500 \$5.90 \$42,000 \$49,000 \$56,500 \$54,000 Construction \$1,400 Land \$1,400 \$42.00 Total costs Typical GFA square 330 360 360 360 360 360 360 360 360 330 330 330 330 330 feet per stall Cost per square foot \$12 \$63 \$42 \$19 \$12 \$71 \$64 \$38 \$173 \$161 \$182 \$183 \$168 Parking levels 1 7 5 5 Reported on-grade expenses for recent RLB. RLB. sed on a 355-stall Walluku Primary source for RLB, based on Reported on-grade expenses for recent ivate residential developments in West ased on construction cost 5 facilities O'ahu, adjusted for soft costs, and O'ahu, adjusted for required landscape igation and lighting costs, soft costs, a geographic factors

Figure 1. Hawaii Parking Stall Cost Estimates (PBR Hawaii & Associates)

Sources: Rider Levett Bucknall, 2020, PBR HAWAII, 2020 (land costs), verbal estimate of recent on-grade hard construction costs by O'ahu developers.

These extraordinary costs, coupled with the long lead-time necessary to gain authorization and appropriation(s) for a MILCON project, have driven TAMC and VA leadership to develop alternate operational solutions to mitigate patient and family transportation and parking issues. These short-term solutions include:

- Valet Paid valet service (\$5.00) with approximately 60 parking stalls; this service is well-utilized:
- TAMC Trolley On-call, free service to transport patients, staff, and visitors from remote parking areas to TAMC;
- VA Shuttle Service Shuttle available to VA patients for transport from/to the airport and outlying Oahu communities to TAMC;
- VA Parking Structure Efforts continue to expand the existing parking structure;
- Shifting Care Off-Site Patient care is shifted to satellite facilities, when possible, to reduce peak use traffic congestion at TAMC; and
- Access Control USAGH is considering creating an additional TAMC access control
 point to reduce traffic bottlenecks during peak hours.

Finally, the ongoing coronavirus disease 2019 pandemic produced an observable reduction in parking congestion on TAMC during response operations. As more patients and staff used

Includes all facilities and areas associated with the development: may include elevator lobbies, stainwells, bicycle parking, mix of compact vs. standard stalls, landscaped areas and sidewalks, etc. Excludesstorage facilities, waste disposal, and loading docks and areas, if any.

¹Podium Parking is on-grade parking that is sheltered under a building that is elevated on piers.

telehealth and telework options, a decrease in parking requirements was evident. The DHA Hawaii Market Facilities Master Plan study will estimate telehealth/telework impact for parking and other facility capacity targets. DHA-wide increased use of telehealth and telework has the potential to alter facility planning in the near future, as the electronic delivery of healthcare is already affecting facility operations within the MHS and across the civilian sector.

Recent/Planned Major Projects & Studies in the Hawaii Market include the following:

- DHA Hawaii Market Facilities Master Plan Study This study, initiated in FY 2021, will consider recommendations from USAGH's 2014 study, HFPA's 2018 study, recent/planned projects, the 703 TAMC recapitalization study, and projected changes in usage patterns due to increased Telehealth/Telework.
- DHA Hawaii Direct Reporting Market Office Stationing Package Office staff are currently housed in facilities on the TAMC campus; DHA is reviewing their current and future needs.
- FY 2016 MILCON Behavioral Health/Dental Clinic Addition, Schofield Barracks –This \$123.8M and 76,577 square feet (SF) project was completed in February 2021. It includes a parking garage, behavioral health, dental, & physical therapy.
- FY 2016 MILCON Medical/Dental Clinic Replacement, MCB Kaneohe Bay This \$122M and 96,870 SF project was completed in August 2020.
- FY 2023 MILCON Veterinary Treatment Facility Replacement, JBPHH This \$29.8M and 12,367 SF project has been designed.
- FY 2024+ Ambulatory Care Center (ACC) Repairs, Schofield Barracks This project is in planning currently developing 2 phases of O&M alterations (\$150M total) + MILCON for new parking structure (\$52M).
- MILCON ACC Replacement, Makalapa/15th Medical Group Clinic, JBPHH This \$455M 'Super' clinic is in planning. It replaces Air Force & Navy clinics and houses some primary/specialty care relocated from TAMC; the project includes a parking structure at JBPHH, and project costs also include significant burdens for environmental remediation, upgrades to access control point, utilities, etc.

Way Forward

The FY 2021 DHA Hawaii Market Facilities Master Plan study will integrate planning actions for DHA health care facilities across Oahu into a strategic master plan framework for the purpose of modernizing health care infrastructure. This study will assess short- and long-term options to recapitalize aging facilities, consolidate footprint to reduce redundancy, and promote patient-centric options for future investments. DHA and HFPA will seek engagement in this master planning process by stakeholders at USAGH, the supported commands, the DHA Hawaii Market, the VA and their local activities, and higher levels of the DoD to produce a viable investment strategy which supports the Agency's complex mission in Hawaii. DHA and USAGH will work closely to determine strategies and implementation to mitigate the existing TAMC access control point bottleneck.

Conclusion

It is important for our patients' entire experience in our healthcare delivery to be restorative, as well as support and promote their well-being, including arrival to our medical facilities. The parking stall deficit at TAMC is a known and well-studied problem with both short-term and longer-term efforts is underway to address the issue. High construction costs, stringent regulatory guidelines, and the MILCON process (10+ years from project conception to realization), create a perceived lull in the progress being made to alleviate the parking problem. Multiple near-term (1-3 years) and mid-term (4-7 years) projects are in planning which will have a positive impact on parking. The partnership with the VA in Hawaii has borne fruit, as leadership and facility staff continue to collaborate to find parking solutions for patients. The ongoing recapitalization study for the TAMC campus, as directed by section 703 of the NDAA for FY 2017, is expected to conclude in 2022. The results of this study will provide the essential data needed to determine the future of TAMC and its footprint. These results will also provide the FY 2021 DHA Market Facilities Master Plan Study fresh data to assess alternatives. The parking shortfall at TAMC is a critical obstacle to delivering the care experience we strive to achieve. Correcting this issue will be a costly but necessary endeavor to provide the world class health care experience our patients and their families deserve.

Addendum in response to query from the congressional defense committees:

Q(1) What is the current parking situation and requirements of the facility over the next four years?

A(1) In summation of the report above, the deficit of between 1,500 and 2,202 parking stalls at TAMC is a known and well-studied problem with both short-term and long-term efforts already underway to address the issue.

The current/future parking requirement is being further evaluated/validated by a two-pronged study from DHA Facilities Enterprise. The TAMC recapitalization study is being conducted in parallel with the FY 2021 DHA Market Facilities Master Plan Study which is well underway with results expected in Q2 of 2022.

- **Q(2)** Provide the estimated cost of constructing a parking facility separately from the recapitalization efforts of the primary Tripler Army Medical Center facility, to include likely cost items and possible category codes.
- **A(2)** The 2020 PBR Hawaii and Associates report for the Ulupono Initiative estimated the following costs for various types of parking on the island, as follows. (Ref. Exhibit 1 and additional "Cost of Development" data)

Exhibit 1: Representative Cost Estimates

Location	Podium parking	On-grade parking: residential				On-grade parking: commercial				Garage parking: commercial				
	Urban Honolulu	Other O'ahu	Maui Island	Kauan	Hawaii	Other Crahu	Maui Island	Kaua'i	Hawari	Urban Honolulu	Other O'ahu	Maus Island	Kaua'i	Hawaii
Cost per stall: Construction Land Total costs	\$42,000 \$0 \$42,000	\$3,100 \$19,400 \$22,500	\$3,600 \$11,600 \$15,200	\$3,800 \$3,200 \$7,000	\$3,400 \$800 \$4,200	\$5,400 \$20,000 \$25,400	\$6,200 \$17,000 \$23,200	\$6,500 \$7,000 \$13,500	\$5,900 \$7,000 \$12,900	\$42,000 \$15,000 \$57,000	\$49,000 \$4,000 \$53,000	\$56,500 \$3,400 \$59,900	\$59,000 \$1,400 \$60,400	\$1,400
Typical GFA square feet per stall*	330	360	360	360	360	360	360	360	360	330	330	330	330	336
Cost per square foot GFA	\$127	\$63	\$42	\$19	\$12	\$71	\$64	\$36	\$36	\$173	\$161	\$182	\$183	\$168
Parking levels	7	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	7	5	5	5	5
Primary source for construction cost estimate	ALB, based on contractor bids for 5 facilities	Reported on-grade expenses for recent private residential developments in West O'ahu, adjusted for soft costs, and geographic factors				Reported on grade expenses for recent private residential developments in West O'afre, adjusted for required landscape, trigation and lighting costs, soft costs, and geographic factors.				ALB, based on contractor bids for 5 facilities	RLB, based on a 355-stall Walluku municipal parking structure			

Notices all facilities and areas associated with the (seekingment: may include elevator lobbies, stanwards, troycle parking, mix of compact vs. standard stalls, landscaped areas and sidewalds, etc. Excludes strongs facilities, weather disposal, and loading stokes and areas, if any.

Sources: Rider Levelt Buckmall, 2020; PBR HAWAII, 2020 (land couts), verbal assimate of recent on-grade hard construction scots by O'ahu sevelopers.

Cost of Development

• Large Commercial Development:

○ On or in urban Honolulu (garage parking) – \$140,000-\$190,000 per 1,000 square feet of facility gross floor area (GFA) (estimate for size of facility).

- Structured, multi-level podium parking:
 - o Urban Honolulu \$42,000 per space, or about \$127 per square foot of GFA. (Assumes no land cost since other development is "stacked" on top of the podium parking levels).
- Free-standing garage parking for commercial development (Med Center Tower):
 - Urban Honolulu \$57,000 per space, or about \$173 per square foot.
 - Other Oahu \$53,000 per space, or about \$161 per square foot.
- On-grade parking for commercial development (Med Cen surface lot):
 - Other Oahu \$25,400 per space, or about \$71 per square foot.
- On-grade parking for mid- to low-rise residential development (Large Clinic lot):
 - Other Oahu \$22,500 per space, or about \$63 per square foot.

It is anticipated that cost of a future parking structure on the TAMC installation would exceed the PBR Hawaii and Associates Study 2020 cost for parking garage stalls. The recently completed MILCON project at Schofield Barracks awarded in 2016, included a 5-story (429 stall) parking structure, and exceeded the PBR Hawaii and Associates Study for 2020, totaling \$27.1M which equates to \$63,274 per stall. When that cost is adjusted forward, considering only the Military Construction Escalation Rates in UFC 3-701-01, it is estimated that parking structure would currently exceed \$32.2M, or \$75,150 per stall.

- Q(3) What is the estimated timeline for designing and constructing a typical parking structure in Hawaii?
- **A(3)** The current timeline for designing and constructing a parking structure is approximately four years and was estimated from the recently completed MILCON project at Schofield Barracks, as follows:

5-Story parking structure design began: 3/15/2015

Actual Contract Awarded: 5/17/2016 Actual Contract Notice to Proceed: 6/16/2016

Original Required Completion: 12/08/2017 Actual Construction Completion: 4/08/2019

Original Schedule BOD: 1/22/2018 Actual BOD: 4/22/2019

Contract Award with options: \$27,084,000.00

Modifications: \$1,060,613.40

TOTAL: \$27,144,613.40

429 Stalls = \$63,274 / stall

(Note: This exceeds the PBR Hawaii and Associates Study cost for parking garage stalls)